

Authorized documents: all documents, no electronic devices. You may answer the questions in French or English.

NB:

- A few questions are more difficult, they are highlighted by a “*”. Of course additional points will be associated with these questions.
- Questions are written in such a way that you can easily skip them if you wish. However for solving a question you may need results stated in earlier questions.

1) Let M be the following term of PCF:

$$M = \text{fix}(\lambda x' \text{succ}(x))$$

- 1.1) Provide a typing derivation showing that $\vdash M : \iota$.
- 1.2) Prove that $[M] = \emptyset$ (in the relational model).
- 1.3) Give a typing derivation and compute the relational semantics of the term

$$\lambda f^{\iota \rightarrow \iota} (f) M.$$

[*Hint:* You can use the “intersection type system” presented during the lectures for computing the semantics, Section 7.2.4 in the Lecture Notes.]

2) We record that a $t \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, F)$ is an isomorphism in \mathbf{Rel} (that is there is $t' \in \mathbf{Rel}(F, E)$ such that $t't = \text{Id}$ and $tt' = \text{Id}$) if and only if t is a bijection (identified with its graph, that is, there is a bijection $f : E \rightarrow F$ such that $t = \{(a, f(a)) \mid a \in E\}$).

Given a set E , we define $!^{\top}E$ as the least set such that

- $0 \in !^{\top}E$
- if $a \in E$ then $(1, a) \in !^{\top}E$
- and if $\sigma, \tau \in !^{\top}E$ then $(2, (\sigma, \tau)) \in !^{\top}E$.

To increase readability, we use the following notations: $\langle \rangle = 0$, $\langle a \rangle = (1, a)$ (for $a \in E$) and $\langle \sigma, \tau \rangle = (2, (\sigma, \tau))$. An element of $!^{\top}E$ can be seen as a binary tree with two kind of leaves: “empty leaves” $\langle \rangle$ and “singleton leaves” $\langle a \rangle$ labeled by an element a of E . The main tool of reasoning with such trees is of course induction on their size or structure.

The goal of this exercise is to show that $!^{\top}$ is “almost” an exponential on \mathbf{Rel} .

2.1) Given $t \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, F)$, we define $!^{\top}t$ as the least subset of $!^{\top}E \multimap !^{\top}F$ such that

- $(\langle \rangle, \langle \rangle) \in !^{\top}t$
- $(a, b) \in t \Rightarrow (\langle a \rangle, \langle b \rangle) \in !^{\top}t$
- $(\sigma_1, \tau_1), (\sigma_2, \tau_2) \in !^{\top}t \Rightarrow (\langle \sigma_1, \sigma_2 \rangle, \langle \tau_1, \tau_2 \rangle) \in !^{\top}t$.

Prove that $!^{\top}$ is a functor. [*Hint:* Let $s \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, F)$ and $t \in \mathbf{Rel}(F, G)$. By induction on $\sigma \in !^{\top}E$ prove that for any $\varphi \in !^{\top}G$ one has $(\sigma, \varphi) \in (!^{\top}t)(!^{\top}s) \Leftrightarrow (\sigma, \varphi) \in !^{\top}(ts)$. Of course one can also use an induction on φ .]

2.2) We define $\text{der}_E^{\top} \in \mathbf{Rel}(!^{\top}E, E)$ by $\text{der}_E^{\top} = \{(\langle a \rangle, a) \mid a \in E\}$. Prove that it is a natural transformation $!^{\top} \Rightarrow \text{Id}$. [*Hint:* For this, consider $t \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, F)$ and $(\sigma, b) \in !^{\top}E \times F$. By induction on σ , prove that $(\sigma, b) \in \text{der}_F^{\top}(!^{\top}t) \Leftrightarrow (\sigma, b) \in t \text{der}_E^{\top}$. You will see in particular that when σ is not of shape $\langle a \rangle$ for some $a \in E$, the two sides of this equivalence are false and hence the equivalence holds trivially.]

2.3) We define a function $\text{flat} : !^{\top}!^{\top}E \rightarrow !^{\top}E$ by induction on trees as follows:

- $\text{flat}(\langle \rangle) = \langle \rangle$,
- $\text{flat}(\langle \sigma \rangle) = \sigma$ and
- $\text{flat}(\langle \Sigma_1, \Sigma_2 \rangle) = \langle \text{flat}(\Sigma_1), \text{flat}(\Sigma_2) \rangle$.

We define $\text{digg}_E^{\top} \in \mathbf{Rel}(!^{\top}E, !^{\top}!^{\top}E)$ by $\text{digg}_E^{\top} = \{(\text{flat}(\Sigma), \Sigma) \mid \Sigma \in !^{\top}!^{\top}E\}$. Prove that digg^{\top} is a natural transformation $!^{\top} \Rightarrow (!^{\top} \circ !^{\top})$. [*Hint*: Let $t \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, F)$ and $(\sigma, b) \in !^{\top}E \times F$. By induction on $\Theta \in !^{\top}!^{\top}F$, prove that for all $\sigma \in !^{\top}E$, one has $(\sigma, \Theta) \in \text{digg}_F^{\top}(!^{\top}t) \Leftrightarrow (\sigma, \Theta) \in (!^{\top}!^{\top}t) \text{digg}_E^{\top}$.]

2.4) Prove that $(!^{\top}, \text{der}^{\top}, \text{digg}^{\top})$ is a comonad.

2.5) We record that, given sets $(E_i)_{i \in I}$, their cartesian product $E = \&_{i \in I} E_i$ in \mathbf{Rel} is defined by $E = \cup_{i \in I} (\{i\} \times E_i)$. For each $i \in I$ we define a function $\mathbf{p}_i^{\top} : !^{\top}E \rightarrow !^{\top}E_i$ by induction as follows:

- $\mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\langle \rangle) = \langle \rangle$,
- $\mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\langle (i, a) \rangle) = \langle a \rangle$,
- $\mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\langle (j, a) \rangle) = \langle \rangle$ if $j \neq i$,
- and $\mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\langle \sigma_1, \sigma_2 \rangle) = \langle \mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\sigma_1), \mathbf{p}_i^{\top}(\sigma_2) \rangle$.

Provide a counter-example showing that it is not true that the function \mathbf{p}_i^{\top} coincides (as a graph) with $!^{\top}\text{pr}_i \in \mathbf{Rel}(!^{\top}E, !^{\top}E_i)$, where $\text{pr}_i \in \mathbf{Rel}(E, E_i)$ is the i -th projection of the cartesian product, that is $\text{pr}_i = \{((i, a), a) \mid a \in E_i\}$.

2.6) Then we define $\mathbf{m}_{E_1, E_2}^{\top} \in \mathbf{Rel}(!^{\top}E_1 \otimes !^{\top}E_2, !^{\top}(E_1 \& E_2))$ as

$$\mathbf{m}_{E_1, E_2}^{\top} = \{((\mathbf{p}_1^{\top}(\theta), \mathbf{p}_2^{\top}(\theta)), \theta) \mid \theta \in !^{\top}(E_1 \& E_2)\}.$$

We admit that this morphism is natural in E_1 and E_2 . Provide a counter-example showing that $\mathbf{m}_{E_1, E_2}^{\top}$ is not an isomorphism in general.

2.7) Prove that the following diagram commutes (lax monoidality).

$$\begin{array}{ccc} (!^{\top}E_1 \otimes !^{\top}E_2) \otimes !^{\top}E_3 & \xrightarrow{\alpha} & !^{\top}E_1 \otimes (!^{\top}E_2 \otimes !^{\top}E_3) \\ \downarrow \mathbf{m}_{E_1, E_2}^{\top} \otimes \text{Id} & & \downarrow \text{Id} \otimes \mathbf{m}_{E_2, E_3}^{\top} \\ !^{\top}(E_1 \& E_2) \otimes !^{\top}E_3 & & !^{\top}E_1 \otimes !^{\top}(E_2 \& E_3) \\ \downarrow \mathbf{m}_{E_1 \& E_2, E_3}^{\top} & & \downarrow \mathbf{m}_{E_1, E_2 \& E_3}^{\top} \\ !^{\top}((E_1 \& E_2) \& E_3) & \xrightarrow{!^{\top}(\langle \text{pr}_1 \text{pr}_1, \langle \text{pr}_2 \text{pr}_1, \text{pr}_2 \rangle \rangle)} & !^{\top}(E_1 \& (E_2 \& E_3)) \end{array}$$

[*Hint*: Define two functions $f, g : !^{\top}(E_1 \& (E_2 \& E_3)) \rightarrow (!^{\top}E_1 \otimes !^{\top}E_2) \otimes !^{\top}E_3$ allowing to describe simply the two morphisms that have to be proven equal. Prove that these two functions are equal.]

2.8) We define a function $\text{ms} : !^{\top}E \rightarrow !E$ (where $!E$ is the set $\mathcal{M}_{\text{fin}}(E)$ of finite multisets of elements of E , the exponential on \mathbf{Rel} presented during the lectures) as follows:

- $\text{ms}(\langle \rangle) = \square$,
- $\text{ms}(\langle a \rangle) = [a]$ and
- $\text{ms}(\langle \sigma, \tau \rangle) = \text{ms}(\sigma) + \text{ms}(\tau)$.

We define $\text{ms}_E = \{(\sigma, \text{ms}(\sigma)) \mid \sigma \in !^{\top}E\}$. Prove that this is a natural transformation $!^{\top} \Rightarrow !$.

2.9) Prove that the following diagrams are commutative

$$\begin{array}{ccc}
!^{\top}!^{\top}E & \xrightarrow{!^{\top}ms_E} & !^{\top}!E \\
ms_{!^{\top}E} \downarrow & & \downarrow ms_{!E} \\
!!^{\top}E & \xrightarrow{!ms_E} & !!E
\end{array}
\qquad
\begin{array}{ccc}
!^{\top}E & \xrightarrow{digg^{\top}E} & !^{\top}!^{\top}E \\
ms_E \downarrow & & \downarrow m \\
!E & \xrightarrow{digg_E} & !!E
\end{array}$$

where m is the morphism $!^{\top}!^{\top}E \rightarrow !!E$ defined in two different ways by the left hand diagram.

3) Remember that a coherence space E is a pair $(|E|, \circlearrowright_E)$ where $|E|$ is a set (the web) and \circlearrowright_E is a binary symmetric and reflexive relation on $|E|$ (coherence relation), and that the cliques of E form a domain that we will denote as $\text{Cl}(E)$. Remember that \frown_E is the strict coherence relation: $a \frown_E b$ if $a \neq b$ and $a \circlearrowright_E b$.

Remember also that, given coherence spaces E and F one defines a coherence space $E \multimap F$ whose cliques are the linear morphisms from E to F ($|E \multimap F| = |E| \times |F|$, $(a_1, a_2) \circlearrowright_{E \multimap F} (b_1, b_2)$ if $a_1 \circlearrowright_E a_2 \Rightarrow b_1 \circlearrowright_F b_2$ and $a_1 \frown_E a_2 \Rightarrow b_1 \frown_F b_2$). We use \mathbf{Coh} for the category of coherence spaces and linear maps, composition being defined as relational composition and identities being the diagonal relations. We also write $t : E \multimap F$ when $t \in \text{Cl}(E \multimap F) = \mathbf{Coh}(E, F)$.

Given coherence spaces E and F , we say that a function $f : |E| \rightarrow |F|$ is an *embedding* if

- f is injective
- and $\forall a, a' \in |E| \ a \circlearrowright_E a' \Leftrightarrow f(a) \circlearrowright_F f(a')$. [Warning: this has to be an equivalence, not a simple implication!]

We use \mathbf{Coh}^e for the category of coherence spaces and embeddings. We write $f : E \triangleleft F$ when $f \in \mathbf{Coh}^e(E, F)$.

Let $S = (E_n, f_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ be a family where the E_n are coherence spaces and $f_n : E_n \triangleleft E_{n+1}$. Such a family will be called an *embedding system*. If $n, p \in \mathbb{N}$ with $n \leq p$, we set $f_{n,p} = f_{p-1} \circ \dots \circ f_n : E_n \triangleleft E_p$. In particular $f_{n,n} = \text{Id}$.

Let $A = \cup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} (\{n\} \times |E_n|)$. We say that an element (n, a) of A is *root* if $n = 0$, or if $n > 0$ and there is no $a' \in |E_{n-1}|$ such that $f_{n-1}(a') = a$, or equivalently $a \in |E_n| \setminus f_{n-1}(|E_{n-1}|)$. Let A_0 be the set of all root elements of A .

3.1) Prove that for any $(n, a) \in A$ there is exactly one $(p, b) \in A_0$ such that $p \leq n$ and $f_{p,n}(b) = a$. We set $\text{root}(n, a) = (p, b)$. [Hint: By induction on n , prove that the property holds for all $a \in |E_n|$.]

We define a “limit” coherence space $E = \text{Lim } S$ by taking $|E| = A_0$ and coherence specified as follows. Let $(n, a), (p, b) \in |E| = A_0$. We say that $(n, a) \circlearrowright_E (p, b)$ if

- $n = p$ and $a \circlearrowright_{E_n} b$
- or $n < p$ and $f_{n,p}(a) \circlearrowright_{E_p} b$ (notice that, in that case, necessarily $f_{n,p}(a) \neq b$ because b is root)
- or $n > p$ and $a \circlearrowright_{E_n} f_{p,n}(b)$ (similar remark).

3.2) For each $n \in \mathbb{N}$, prove that the function $g_n : |E_n| \rightarrow |E|$ defined by $g_n(a) = \text{root}(n, a)$ is an injection.

3.3) Prove that $g_n : E_n \triangleleft E$.

We consider now three examples of embedding systems. Let the sequence $(E_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ of coherence spaces be defined as follows: $E_0 = \top$ (the coherence space such that $|\top| = \emptyset$) and $E_{n+1} = (1 \& (1 \oplus E_n))$. In other words (up to an isomorphism) $|E_n| = \{1, \dots, n\} \times \{1, -1\}$ and $(i, \varepsilon) \circlearrowright_{E_n} (i', \varepsilon')$ if

- $i < i'$ and $\varepsilon = 1$
- or $i' < i$ and $\varepsilon' = 1$
- or $i = i'$.

Hence (with the notations above), $A = \{(n, i, \varepsilon) \mid n, i \in \mathbb{N}, 1 \leq i \leq n \text{ and } \varepsilon \in \{1, -1\}\}$.

3.4) Let $n, p \in \mathbb{N}$ with $n \leq p$ and let $\varphi : \{1, \dots, n\} \rightarrow \{1, \dots, p\}$ be an injection. Let $f : |E_n| \rightarrow |E_p|$ be defined by $f(i, \varepsilon) = (\varphi(i), \varepsilon)$. Prove that $f : E_n \triangleleft E_p$ if and only if φ is monotone (that is $i \leq j \Rightarrow \varphi(i) \leq \varphi(j)$).

3.5) We define $S = (E_n, f_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ where $f_n(i, \varepsilon) = (i, \varepsilon)$ for all $(i, \varepsilon) \in |E_n|$. Prove that each f_n is an embedding and that an element (n, i, ε) is root if and only if $i = n$. [*Hint*: By induction on $n \in \mathbb{N}$ prove that for all $i \in \{1, \dots, n\}$, (n, i, ε) is root if and only if $i = n$.]

3.6) For $(n, i, \varepsilon) \in A$ (so that $1 \leq i \leq n$) prove that $\text{root}(n, i, \varepsilon) = (i, i, \varepsilon)$.

3.7) Let $E = \text{Lim } S$, we can identify $|E|$ with $\mathbb{N} \times \{1, -1\}$. With this identification, prove that $(i, \varepsilon) \circ_E (i', \varepsilon')$ if

- $i < i'$ and $\varepsilon = 1$
- or $i' < i$ and $\varepsilon' = 1$
- or $i = i'$.

3.8) We define another embedding system $T = (E_n, g_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ where $g_n(i, \varepsilon) = (i + 1, \varepsilon)$ for all $(i, \varepsilon) \in |E_n|$. Prove that each g_n is an embedding and that an element (n, i, ε) is root if and only if $i = 1$.

3.9) Prove that for any $(n, i, \varepsilon) \in A$, one has $\text{root}(n, i, \varepsilon) = (n - i + 1, 1, \varepsilon)$.

3.10) Let $F = \text{Lim } T$. We identify $|F|$ with $\mathbb{N} \times \{1, -1\}$ by mapping a root element $(n, 1, \varepsilon) \in A$ to $(n, \varepsilon) \in \mathbb{N} \times \{1, -1\}$. With this identification, prove that $(n, \varepsilon) \circ_F (n', \varepsilon')$ if and only if

- $n = n'$ or
- $n > n'$ and $\varepsilon = 1$ or
- $n' > n$ and $\varepsilon' = 1$.

3.11)* Prove that $\text{Lim } S$ and $\text{Lim } T$ are not isomorphic (an isomorphism from a coherence space from E to F is the same thing as an embedding $E \triangleleft F$ which, as a function, is a bijection).

3.12)* As in questions (3.5)–(3.7) and (3.8)–(3.10), work out the following example: let $H_n = E_{2^n}$ and $h_n : H_n \triangleleft H_{n+1}$ be defined by $h_n(i, \varepsilon) = (2i, \varepsilon)$. Let $U = (H_n, h_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$. Prove that $G = \text{Lim } U$ can be described as follows: $|G| = \{r \in \mathbb{D} \mid r > 0\} \times \{1, -1\}$ where \mathbb{D} is the set of rational numbers which can be written $\frac{k}{2^n}$ (dyadic numbers) and $(r, \varepsilon) \circ_G (r', \varepsilon')$ if

- $r = r'$
- or $r < r'$ and $\varepsilon = 1$
- or $r' < r$ and $\varepsilon' = 1$.

3.13)* Prove that $\text{Lim } U$ is neither isomorphic to $\text{Lim } S$ nor to $\text{Lim } T$.

4)

4.1) Given probabilistic coherence spaces (PCS for short) X, Y and Z and $t \in \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}^{|(X \otimes !Y) \rightarrow Z|}$, prove that $t \in \mathbf{Pcoh}(X \otimes !Y, Z)$ if and only if

$$\forall u \in \mathbf{P}(X) \forall v \in \mathbf{P}(Y) \quad t \cdot (u \otimes v^{(!)}) \in \mathbf{P}(Z).$$

We use \mathbf{e}_i for the element of $\mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}^I$ such that $(\mathbf{e}_i)_j = \delta_{i,j}$ ($= 1$ if $i = j$ and 0 otherwise).

Given an at most countable set I , we use \bar{I} for the probabilistic coherence space such that $|\bar{I}| = I$ and $\mathbf{P}(\bar{I}) = \{u \in \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}^I \mid \sum_{i \in I} u_i \leq 1\}$. Notice that (up to a trivial isomorphism) $\bar{I} = \bigoplus_{i \in I} 1$. Let $B = \{0, 1\}$ and let $W = B^*$ (the set of finite sequences of elements of B).

4.2) For each $w \in W$ we define a function $f_w : \mathbf{P}(\bar{B}) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}^B$ by induction on w (using $\langle \rangle$ for the empty word and aw for prefixing $w \in W$ with $a \in B$): for all $u \in \mathbf{P}(\bar{B})$,

- $f_{\langle \rangle}(u) = \mathbf{e}_0$
- $f_{0w}(u) = u_0 f_w(x) + u_1 \mathbf{e}_1$
- $f_{1w}(u) = u_0 \mathbf{e}_0 + u_1 f_w(x)$

By induction on w , prove that there is a family $(t_w)_{w \in W}$ of elements of $\mathbf{P}(!\overline{B} \multimap \overline{B})$ such that

$$\forall u \in \mathbf{P}(\overline{B}) \quad f_w(u) = t_w \cdot u^{(1)}.$$

[*Hint:* Prove first that if $s \in \mathbf{P}(!\overline{B} \multimap \overline{B})$ and $i \in B$ then $s^{(i)} \in \mathbb{R}_{\geq 0}^{!|\overline{B} \multimap \overline{B}|}$ defined by $s_{m,b}^{(i)} = s_{m+[i],b}$ satisfies $s^{(i)} \in \mathbf{P}(!\overline{B} \multimap \overline{B})$ and $\forall u \in \mathbf{P}(B) \quad s^{(i)} \cdot u^{(1)} = u_i(s \cdot u^{(1)})$.]

4.3) Prove that there is a morphism $t \in \mathbf{Pcoh}(\overline{W} \otimes !\overline{B}, \overline{B})$ such that $\forall w \in W \forall u \in \mathbf{P}(B) \quad t \cdot (\mathbf{e}_w \otimes u^{(1)}) = f_w(u)$.

4.4) Given a word $w \in W$ let $\text{len}(w)$ be its length and $\text{nb}(w)$ the number w represents in binary notation (if w is the word $a_{n-1} \cdots a_0$ then $\text{len}(w) = n$ and $\text{nb}(w) = \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} a_i 2^i$ so that $0 \leq \text{nb}(w) \leq 2^n - 1$). Prove that

$$\forall w \in W \quad f_w\left(\frac{1}{2}\mathbf{e}_0 + \frac{1}{2}\mathbf{e}_1\right) = \frac{\text{nb}(w) + 1}{2^{\text{len}(w)}}\mathbf{e}_0 + \left(1 - \frac{\text{nb}(w) + 1}{2^{\text{len}(w)}}\right)\mathbf{e}_1$$

4.5) Explain the usefulness of the functions f_w in a programming language where the only available random number generator produces $\underline{0}$ with probability $\frac{1}{2}$ and $\underline{1}$ with probability $\frac{1}{2}$, for instance a version of our pPCF where $\text{rand}(r)$ is available only for $r = \frac{1}{2}$.