

Lecture notes

## A survival guide on coherence spaces

Paul-André Melliès

Modèles des langages de programmation  
Master Parisien de Recherche en Informatique

### 1 Coherence spaces

#### 1.1 Definition

**Definition 1.1 (coherence spaces)** *A coherence space is a pair*

$$A = (|A|, \circlearrowleft_A)$$

*consisting of a set  $|A|$  called the web of  $A$  and of a reflexive and symmetric relation*

$$\circlearrowleft_A \subseteq |A| \times |A|$$

*called the coherence.*

So, “coherence space” is a somewhat pedantic word for “reflexive graph”.

#### 1.2 Notations

Our purpose in this note is to construct a model of linear logic where the proofs of a given formula  $A$  are interpreted as *cliques* of the associated coherence space  $\llbracket A \rrbracket$ . As we will see, the interpretation is based to a large extent on the operation of negating a coherence space  $A$  into its dual coherence space  $A^\perp$ . Since the dual graph of a reflexive graph is not reflexive, one finds convenient to introduce the notations below:

- $a \frown_A a'$  means that  $a \circlearrowleft_A a'$  and  $a \neq a'$ .
- $a \smile_A a'$  means that  $\neg(a \circlearrowleft_A a')$  or  $a = a'$ .

### 1.3 Basic constructions

**Negation.** The dual

$$A^\perp$$

of a coherence space  $A$  has the same web as the original coherence space

$$|A^\perp| = |A|$$

and coherence defined as

$$\forall a, a' \in |A| \quad a \circ_{A^\perp} a' \iff a \smile_A a'$$

In other words, the coherence space  $A^\perp$  is the dual graph of  $A$  where every point of the web is moreover made coherent to itself, in order to obtain a reflexive graph.

**Sum.** The sum

$$A \oplus B$$

of two coherence spaces is the coherence space with web the disjoint sum of the two webs:

$$|A \oplus B| = |A| + |B|$$

with coherence defined as

$$\forall a, a' \in |A| \quad \mathbf{inl}(a) \circ_{A \oplus B} \mathbf{inl}(a') \iff a \circ_A a'$$

$$\forall b, b' \in |B| \quad \mathbf{inr}(b) \circ_{A \oplus B} \mathbf{inr}(b') \iff b \circ_B b'$$

$$\forall a \in |A| \quad \forall b \in |B| \quad \mathbf{inl}(a) \smile_{A \oplus B} \mathbf{inr}(b)$$

In other words, the coherence space  $A \oplus B$  is simply defined as the disjoint sum of the two reflexive graphs  $A$  and  $B$ .

**Tensor product.** The tensor product

$$A \otimes B$$

of two coherence spaces is the coherence space with web the product of the two webs:

$$|A \otimes B| = |A| \times |B|$$

with coherence defined as

$$\begin{array}{l} \forall a, a' \in |A| \\ \forall b, b' \in |B| \end{array} \quad a \otimes b \subset_{A \otimes B} a' \otimes b' \quad \iff \quad a \subset_A a' \quad \text{and} \quad b \subset_B b'.$$

In other words, the coherence space  $A \otimes B$  is simply defined as the product of the two reflexive graphs  $A$  and  $B$ . Note that for convenience, we write the pair  $(a, b)$  as  $a \otimes b$  when it is an element of the web of  $A \otimes B$ . We will do it in a similar way for the elements  $a \wp b$  and  $a \multimap b$  of the web  $A \wp B$  or  $A \multimap B$ . This is only a convention which we choose to make the constructions more readable. The anxious reader may replace all of them mentally:  $a \otimes b, a \wp b, a \multimap b$  by a pair  $(a, b)$ .

**Product.** The product

$$A \& B$$

of two coherence spaces is defined as

$$A \& B = (A^\perp \oplus B^\perp)^\perp$$

**Parallel product.** The parallel product

$$A \wp B$$

of two coherence spaces is defined as

$$A \wp B = (A^\perp \otimes B^\perp)^\perp$$

**Linear implication.** The linear implication

$$A \multimap B$$

of two coherence spaces  $A$  and  $B$  is defined as

$$A \multimap B = (A \otimes B^\perp)^\perp$$

Note that

$$A \multimap B = B^\perp \multimap A^\perp$$

**Exercise.** Given two pairs of elements  $(a, b) = a \multimap b$  and  $(a', b') = a' \multimap b'$  of the web of  $A \multimap B$ , show that

$$a \multimap b \circlearrowleft_{A \multimap B} a' \multimap b' \iff \begin{cases} a \circlearrowleft_A a' \text{ implies } b \circlearrowleft_B b' \\ \text{and} \\ b \circlearrowleft_{B^\perp} b' \text{ implies } a \circlearrowleft_{A^\perp} a' \end{cases}$$

Show that this definition is equivalent to the following one

$$a \multimap b \circlearrowleft_{A \multimap B} a' \multimap b' \iff \begin{cases} a \circlearrowleft_A a' \text{ implies } b \circlearrowleft_B b' \\ \text{and} \\ b = b' \text{ implies } a \succsim_A a' \end{cases}$$

## 2 The monoidal category of coherence spaces

### 2.1 Definition

The category  $\mathbf{Coh}$  has

- coherence spaces as objects
- cliques of  $A \multimap B$  as morphisms  $A \rightarrow B$ .

### 2.2 The monoidal structure

Given two morphisms

$$f : A \rightarrow B \quad g : A' \rightarrow B'$$

the morphism

$$f \otimes g : A \otimes A' \rightarrow B \otimes B'$$

is defined as the clique

$$f \otimes g = \{ (a \otimes a') \multimap (b \otimes b') \mid a \multimap b \in f, a' \multimap b' \in g \}$$

**Exercise.** Show that this defines a clique of  $(A \otimes A') \multimap (B \otimes B')$

**Exercise.** Show that this defines a functor

$$\otimes : \mathbf{Coh} \times \mathbf{Coh} \rightarrow \mathbf{Coh}$$

### 2.3 Associativity map

Given three coherence spaces  $A, B, C$ , the associativity map

$$\alpha_{A,B,C} : (A \otimes B) \otimes C \longrightarrow A \otimes (B \otimes C)$$

is defined as the clique

$$\alpha_{A,B,C} = \{ ((a \otimes b) \otimes c) \multimap (a \otimes (b \otimes c)) \mid a \in |A|, b \in |B|, c \in |C| \}$$

### 2.4 Unit maps

Given a coherence space  $A$ , the unit maps

$$\lambda_A : I \otimes A \longrightarrow A$$

$$\rho_A : A \otimes I \longrightarrow A$$

are defined as the cliques

$$\lambda_A = \{ (* \otimes a) \multimap a \mid a \in |A| \}$$

$$\rho_A = \{ (a \otimes *) \multimap a \mid a \in |A| \}$$

### 2.5 Symmetry map

Given two coherence spaces  $A, B$ , the symmetry map

$$\gamma_{A,B} : A \otimes B \longrightarrow B \otimes A$$

is defined as the clique

$$\gamma_{A,B} = \{ (a \otimes b) \multimap (b \otimes a) \mid a \in |A|, b \in |B| \}$$

**Exercise.** Show that  $\gamma$  is natural in  $A$  and  $B$

**Exercise.** Show that  $\gamma$  defines a symmetry in the monoidal category  $\mathbf{Coh}$ .

### 2.6 Evaluation map

Given two coherence spaces  $A, B$ , the evaluation map

$$\mathbf{eval}_{A,B} : A \otimes (A \multimap B) \longrightarrow B$$

is defined as the clique

$$\mathbf{eval}_{A,B} = \{ (a \otimes (a \multimap b)) \multimap b \mid a \in |A|, b \in |B| \}$$

**Exercise.** Show that  $\text{eval}_{A,B}$  defines a clique of the coherence space

$$(A \otimes (A \multimap B)) \multimap B$$

**Exercise.** Show that  $\text{eval}_{A,B}$  satisfies the following universality property: for every coherence space  $X$  and every morphism

$$f : A \otimes X \longrightarrow B$$

there exists a unique morphism

$$h : X \longrightarrow A \multimap B$$

making the diagram

$$\begin{array}{ccc}
 A \otimes (A \multimap B) & \xrightarrow{\text{eval}_{A,B}} & B \\
 \uparrow A \otimes h & \nearrow f & \\
 A \otimes X & & 
 \end{array}$$

commute. Deduce that the category  $\text{Coh}$  is symmetric monoidal closed.

## 2.7 Cartesian product

Given two coherence spaces  $A, B$  define the projection maps

$$\pi_1 : A \& B \longrightarrow A$$

$$\pi_2 : A \& B \longrightarrow B$$

as the coherence spaces

$$\pi_1 = \{ \mathbf{inl}(a) \multimap a \mid a \in |A| \}$$

$$\pi_2 = \{ \mathbf{inr}(b) \multimap b \mid b \in |B| \}$$

**Exercise.** Show that the coherence space  $A \& B$  equipped with the two projection maps  $\pi_1$  and  $\pi_2$  defines a cartesian product of  $A$  and  $B$  in the category  $\text{Coh}$ .